

School of Medicine – Critically Appraised Topic CAT

Student Name: _____

Attachment: _____

Date: _____

CAT Topic: _____

Each student will be required to carry out a CAT presentation. The student will present the CAT in the form of a paper presented at a scientific meeting. They will have 10 minutes for presentation and explanation with 4-5 minutes for questions. They will be marked using the following rubric. The criteria against each mark should be used as a guide for the assessor. 3 is the expected standard. Please comment on all 1 and 2 scores.

Choice of Question		Literature Search		Analysis of paper		Quality of presentation		Conclusion & Discussion	
4	Thoughtful, incisive question, clearly related to relevant clinical problem.	4	Excellent and thorough search strategy.	4	Excellent analysis of paper. All the appropriate issues identified and discussed.	4	Excellent presentation. Clear and appropriate use of visual aids. Keeps to time.	4	Fully justified and appropriate conclusions drawn from the paper. Good and justified responses to questions.
3	Good question well related to clinical problem and of clinical relevance.	3	Good search strategy with good documentation of search.	3	Reasonable analysis of paper. Most of the relevant issues discussed / presented.	3	Clear presentation. Only one or two areas for improvement. Keeps to time.	3	Good summary and conclusion, a few minor improvements possible.
2	Reasonable question but not well related to a clinical scenario.	2	Just adequate search, with limited documentation of search .	2	Marginal analysis of paper. Several significant errors or omissions.	2	Borderline presentation. Poor time keeping. Problems with communication skills.	2	Conclusion not fully justified. Errors in the logic of drawing the conclusion. Poor handling of questions.
1	Poor question, not related to relevant clinical scenario by student.	1	Inadequate search used, with no search strategy documentation.	1	Poor analysis. Many gaps in assessing paper.	1	Very poor presentation. Poor visual aids. Bad time keeping. Poor communication skills.	1	Conclusion not linked to question and analysis. Significant lack of logic and justification in answers.

Specific Comments

Assessor: _____